

New Orleans Historic District Landmarks Commission
Architectural Review Committee
Meeting Minutes

Date: May 23, 2017

Location: City Hall, 1300 Perdido Street, 8th Floor Homeland Security Conference Room, New Orleans, Louisiana.

Called to order: 12:30 p.m.

Adjourned: 3:57 p.m.

Members present: Elliott Perkins, Robbie Cangelosi, Cynthia Dubberley

Members arriving after beginning of the meeting:

Members absent:

I. AGENDA

1. Approval of the minutes of the April 25, 2017 meeting

Motion: Approve the minutes.

By: Elliot Perkins

Seconded: Robbie Cangelosi

Result: Passed

In favor: Robbie Cangelosi, Cynthia Dubberley

Opposed:

Comments:

2. 501 Elysian Fields

Application: Francisco Alecha, applicant; 501 Efa Hotel LLC, owner; Composition, Materiality and Detail Review ONLY with the Partial demolition of two (2) existing warehouses and new construction of 75,000 SF four-story hotel.

Speakers: Allen Johnson, Joel Ross, and Carol Gniady spoke regarding their opposition to the demolition and construction.

Motion. Robbie Cangelosi made a motion to defer this application for additional review. The ARC agreed that the language of the facade appears arbitrary and incoherent, i.e. control joints and reglets lack order, method, or organization across the elevations, the low entry canopy is conflicting with the adjacent openings creating a squat condition at the main entry, and the creation of pilasters across the elevation modules is incomplete and unarticulated. They agreed that the material and proportion of the windows in the wall recess was not consistent and appeared odd and difficult to read. The ARC requested a 3D rendering of the window/wall condition to better understanding how the window and associated trim relates to the exterior plane of the facade. The ARC agreed the site wall(s) at the parking lot at the Decatur St and Marigny St elevation are stark and require further articulation at the pedestrian level. The ARC agreed that the base should consist of a single material the entire 18" off grade, i.e. cast stone with an offset, all brick, or all stucco. Moving forward, the ARC recommended investigating a unified design strategy to establish the composition and materiality of all elevations.

Second: Elliot Perkins

Result: Passed

In Favor: Elliot Perkins, Cynthia Dubberley

Opposed:

Comments:

3. 600 St Roch

Application: Rick A. Fifield, applicant; Roderick A Fifield, owner; Renovation and addition to an existing two-story residential building.

Motion: Robbie Cangelosi made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC recommended removing the columns ('stilts') below the 'tower' element and aligning the walls with the roof monitor below (similar to the previous version of this element). The ARC stated that the gutters appeared busy and complicate the design. They suggested using the same drainage/gutters system around all elements the new addition. The ARC recommended increasing the visibility of the wall surface of the 'tower' element at the Chartres Street elevation (shown in blue) to provide a break between the edge of the shutter in the opened position and the intersecting wall of the shed roof addition (shown in green on the rendering).

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In Favor: Elliott Perkins, Cynthia Dubberley

Opposed:

Comments:

4. 2257 Bayou Rd

Application: 2257 Bayou Rd: Donald Maginnis, applicant; James G Derbes, owner; Modifications to conceptually approved new construction of 950 SF detached accessory building.

Speakers: Justin B. Schmidt spoke regarding his opposition to the modification.

Motion: Robbie Cangelosi made a motion to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC stated that the exterior walls need further articulation. They recommended removing the standard lap siding and installing flush siding with properly detailed pilasters and capitals. The also recommended a roofing material that relates to the existing accessory structures, i.e. gazebo and shed.

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In Favor: Elliott Perkins, Cynthia Dubberley

Opposed:

Comments:

5. 1522 Chippewa St

Application: Robert Boyd, applicant; St. Michael Special School For, owner; Restore circa 1850's Convent building, and construct new chapel addition at the rear.

Motion: Robbie Cangelosi made a motion to defer this application for additional review. The ARC agreed this was a successful renovation of the existing school building. They agreed that the separation between the new and the old should highlighted; the cornice should break and the roof pitch lowered. The proportions of the columns and roof structure over the covered ramp area should be studied. The railings at the front elevation are not typical, but as they existing in the historic photo they can be reinstalled. The ARC agreed that the railing should be distinctly different than the decorative cast iron railings.

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In Favor: Elliott Perkins, Cynthia Dubberley

Opposed:

Comments:

6. 2322 St Thomas St.

Application: Robert Bandzuch, applicant/owner; New construction of a two-story, two-family residential building.

Motion: Cynthia Dubberley made a motion to defer this application for additional review. The proposed building is not contextual and needs to be restudied to meet the Guidelines for New Construction. The form is atypical and massing of the rear portion too large in relation to that of the single story front portion. The front yard site coverage is dedicated to the vehicle, unlike any other building on the block. The rhythm, sizes and locations of windows are out of scale and do not fit within the context. The proposed mansard type roof is atypical and alien to the neighborhood, it should be restudied so that the shingles are not such a large portion of the façade. The entrances should be located on the principal facade. The choice, size, location and arrangement of architectural elements and projection such as balconies, should reflect those of surrounding buildings.

Second: Elliott Perkins

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments:

7. 3000 Royal St.

Application: Gary Krasnow, applicant; Union Brew Pub LLC, owner; Modification to previously approved plans for first floor renovation to existing two-story commercial building. Remove existing window and install new doors at location of new electrical service

Motion: Robbie Cangelosi made a motion to recommend approval of the installation of the double doors for the new electrical service.

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, Cynthia Dubberley

Opposed:

Comments:

8. 2112-14 N Rampart St

Application: Southern Elevations & Shoring, Inc, applicant; Saxony Holdings LLC, owner; Raise existing one-story, two-family double shotgun 3'-0 to 4.2' above grade.

Motion: Elliot Perkins made a motion to deny the application. The ARC voted that the wide proportions of the openings, use of French doors in the center openings, floor height, and simple detailing are all indications that this building is much older than those around it. The ARC agreed that great care should be taken to maintain this early example of vernacular architecture. The ARC noted that base flood elevation only requires a floor height of 18" and recommends that the elevation be limited to a maximum floor height of 36". The ARC recommended working with the style of the existing building to determine appropriate modifications and detailing i.e. installing French doors and louvered shutters across all opening at the front elevation, and wood weatherboards in lieu of drop lap siding. Additionally, the ARC recommended working with Staff to determine the elevations requirements and/or options for this structure.

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments:

9. 3309 Marais St

Application: 3309 Marais St: Nathan Garnache, applicant; Burk Property Investments LLC, owner; Demolish existing rear addition and construct new camelback addition.

Motion: Elliot Perkins made a motion to conceptually approve the application with recommendations and the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC made the following recommendations:

- The eaves at the camelback should match the eaves of the existing building (no overhangs).
- The fascia boards at the front and rear gables should be eliminated.
- The difference between the two sizes of siding should be exaggerated to make it look more intentional.
- The profile of the shed roof at the side entry porch should be slimmer. The roof should be raised to work better with the entry configuration.

Result: Passed

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments:

10. 3305 Marais St

Application: 3305 Marais St: Nathan Garnache, applicant; owner; Construct new two-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: Elliot Perkins made a motion for approval

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Failed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, Cynthia Dubberley

Opposed: Robbie Cangelosi

Comments:

The ARC was unable to reach a majority decision, resulting in no action being taken on this application.

11. 636 Lizardi St

Application: L. Jeff Williams, applicant; New Orleans Redevelopment Authority, owner; Construct new two-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: Cynthia Dubberley made a motion to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed that the window on the left side of the street facing stairwell wall be adjusted to match the similar house at 632 Lizardi St. Also, in order to reduce the height of the fascia on the front porch, conventional ceiling joists should be used for framing.

Second: Robbie Cangelosi

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments:

12. 827-831 Verret St

Application: 827 Verret St: Seth Welty, applicant; New Orleans Redevelopment Authority, owner; Construct new two-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: Elliot Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval with their recommendations and the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed that the non-mirrored option is preferable, as it is "friendlier" to the adjacent building. The roof slope should be reduced to be closer to an 8/12 slope. This may be accomplished in part by raising the soffit at the front overhang. The proportions of the front windows are awkward; windows should be either standard size windows or should extend all the way to the floor. The bottom panel and transoms are redundant and should be eliminated.

Result: Passed

Second: Robbie Cangelosi

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments:

13. 900 City Park Ave.

Application: Julie Ford, applicant; Gore-St Tammany LLC, owner; Construct new exterior exit stair at Landmark building

Motion: Elliot Perkins made a motion to defer the application for additional review. The ARC agreed that an exterior stair on a Landmark building in a prominent location, as proposed, is not appropriate.

However, the ARC made the following recommendations should the Commission vote to grant conceptual approval: The new exit stair should not match the existing gallery and its detailing should be simplified.

Additionally, the ARC felt that the new exterior stair would be more appropriate on the Hennessey St. side of the building and recommended further study of alternate stair locations.

Second: Robbie Cangelosi

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments:

14. 625 Esplanade Ave

Application: Charles Oliver, applicant; Chandelier Development Nola LLC, owner; Construct three-and half-story, two family residential building.

Motion: Elliot Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the ARC level. The ARC agreed that the balcony deck appears heavy. They recommended reducing the depth of the balcony and deck to lighten the projecting element. They also recommended looking at the neighboring buildings to determine a strategy for the front elevation, i.e. open balconies with brackets or cast iron balconies. They recommended removing the cross members of the garage door as it appears 'barn-like'. They recommended reducing the height of the garage door and incorporating a transom with iron security grille infill. The ARC recommended changing the roof slope to 8:12 and modifying the dormers to reflect appropriate proportions and detailing.

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments:

15. 930 Louisa St

Application: Alexander Adamick, applicant; Frankenheimer Credit Shelter Trust, owner; Structural renovation of existing single-family residence and existing accessory structure, including new dormers and balcony.

Motion: Elliot Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed that the dormer as presented is too large in scale and is set too close to the existing cross gable. They suggested eliminating the portion of the dormer at the study to reduce the size of the dormer and minimize its visibility. The spring point of the dormer should be set below the existing roof ridge. Additionally, the rear balcony depth should be reduced to a maximum of 4'-0".

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, Cynthia Dubberley, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments:

At this time, there being no further business to discuss, the meeting was adjourned.